University of Miami Scholarly Repository

Faculty Research, Publications, and Presentations

Department of Health Informatics

1-1-2011

Isabel, a Clinical Decision Support System

Emily J. Vardell University of Miami Miller School of Medicine, evardell@med.miami.edu

Mary Moore PhD University of Miami Miller School of Medicine, mmoore@med.miami.edu

Recommended Citation

Vardell, E., & Moore, M. (2011). Isabel, a clinical decision support system. Medical Reference Services Quarterly, 30(2), 158-166.

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Department of Health Informatics at Scholarly Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Research, Publications, and Presentations by an authorized administrator of Scholarly Repository. For more information, please contact repository.library@miami.edu.

ONLINE UPDATES: A COLUMN FOR SEARCH ANALYSTS

Emily Vardell, Column Editor

Isabel, a Clinical Decision Support System

Emily Vardell

Mary Moore

ABSTRACT. A Clinical Decision Support System (CDSS) is an interactive tool designed to assist clinicians in making decisions, such as determining a diagnosis. The Isabel Database is a CDSS featuring a clinical checklist and topic-specific knowledge components. This column contains an overview of the database, provides searching tips, and places Isabel within the context of the CDSS field.

KEYWORDS. CDSS, Clinical Decision Support Systems, Isabel, point-of-care systems

AUTHORS.

Emily Vardell, MLS (evardell@med.miami.edu) is Director for Reference, Education, and Community Engagement, Department of Health Informatics, Calder Memorial Library, University of Miami Miller School of Medicine, 1601 NW 10th Avenue, Miami, FL 33136. Mary Moore, PhD (mmoore@med.miami.edu) is Executive Director, Department of Health Informatics, Calder Memorial Library, University of Miami Miller School of Medicine, 1601 NW 10th Avenue, Miami, FL 33136. Comments and suggestions should be sent to the Column Editor, Emily Vardell (evardell@med.miami.edu).

When health practitioners want assistance with clinical decision making, they may turn to a colleague, or to the literature, or in some cases, to a Clinical Decision Support System (CDSS). These systems, first documented in the 1950s,¹ are designed to assist individuals at the point of care. Examples include MYCIN, developed in the 1970s by Stanford University to aid diagnoses of bacterial diseases²; DXplain from Massachusetts General Hospital, released in 1986, still functional today, and covering 2,400 diagnoses^{3,4}; and Isabel⁵ from Isabel Healthcare, now one of the most comprehensive tools available to support diagnostic decisions.

BACKGROUND

In 1999, when the daughter of the founder became gravely ill as the result of misdiagnosis, he was inspired to found the Isabel CDSS, named for his daughter. In 2002, the first version, for pediatrics, was launched in the UK. The adult version of Isabel became available worldwide in 2005 and now covers thousands of diagnoses. The resource is a teaching tool to help faculty, students, and clinicians remain up-to-date on new studies.

Isabel consists of two parts, the Isabel Diagnosis Checklist System (IDCS) and the Knowledge component (the latter of which will be covered later in the article). The IDCS is comprised of a database of more than 11,000 diagnoses and 4,000 drugs. To use the IDCS, a clinician enters a patient's symptoms and clinical signs, or the data is extracted from the electronic medical record. Isabel then checks the inputted symptoms and signs against its database to provide a list of likely diagnoses and/or medications that might cause specific symptoms. Isabel uses proprietary natural language processing software to search its database of medical textbooks and journals. The database and the quality of search results are validated each week by a team of clinicians.

One of the benefits of Isabel is that it requires no formal training. Isabel is designed to be easy and quick to use. The home page of Isabel is appropriately simplified, featuring a box where the physician inputs patient information and symptoms in the left-hand column and results based on this information are displayed in the right-hand column (this is the user-side of the IDCS). In the "enter clinical features" box, the first drop-down menu requires a patient's age (categories include neonate, infant, younger child, older child, adolescent, young adult, adult, and geriatric, each with corresponding age brackets). This is the only required patient characteristic in Isabel.

In addition, the user can select the gender of the patient. If female is selected along with an appropriate age box, an additional drop-down menu appears allowing the user to specify if the patient is pregnant or not (not specified is allowed). Once this background information has been entered, the user can enter clinical features keeping the "3 golden rules" in mind:

- Be as specific as possible (i.e., Isabel will understand "persistent cough," which is preferable to "cough")
- Do not use negatives (e.g., "no fever")
- Do not use numbers (instead describe numerical results in words, e.g., elevated white blood cell count).⁶

SAMPLE SEARCH

To conduct a sample search, the author selected the geriatric age bracket (65 years and over) and male as the gender. In the clinical features section, she entered "rales," "smoker," "low oxygen saturations," and "persistent cough." With the autosuggest feature, one can simply begin entering

in the symptoms and Isabel will make suggestions of which symptoms one might be most interested in.

After clicking "get checklist," Isabel displayed a list of possible diagnoses (as shown in Figure 1). The number of diagnoses displayed can be controlled by using the "show" function. The default sort option is by "most relevant," but one can also sort by "most common" or "don't miss diagnoses." The "don't miss diagnoses" are also indicated with a red flag on the diagnoses list. The entire list can be saved, printed, or e-mailed using the "action" drop-down menu.

CHECKLIST KNOWLEDGE START C	ME Capture Administration Menu IDEAS S	Support Training Tools M	obile Access Logout
enter clinical features synonyr	ns diagnoses		
age* voung adult (17-29vrs) V	Most Relev	/ant	New !
	sort by: most relevant 💙	action: -select- 💌	Checklist ? Give us your
gender • female • male	show: 10 20 30 all	🕕 New ! 🕕	feedback! Select 🖒 or 🖗
pregnancy (- not specified -)	Headache Disorders ■	🔬 🗛 🕐 NEURO 🔺	next to each diagnosis?
Refine search:	Vasomotor Rhinitis	🔥 🏠 🕐 RESP	
travel North America 🗸 🛈) 💽 Sinusitis	🔥 🏠 🕐 RESP	
history:	Allergic Rhinitis	🔥 🏠 🕐 ALLERG	
show me:	Wegener's Granulomatosis	🔬 🏠 🕐 RHEUM	
(e) diagnoses	Kartagener Syndrome	🔥 🏠 🕐 RESP	
O causative drugs	Influenza Viruses	A A INFEC	
O bioterrorist agents	Mucormycosis / Zygomycosis	NFEC	
Enter clinical features, <u>no</u> negatives, <u>r</u>	O Sarcoidosis	RESP	
numbers: 🔍	Rhinoviral Infection	A A ? INFEC	
nasal congestion	Common Cold / Nasopharyngitis	s 🛝 🏠 🕐 RESP	
rhinorrhea	Pet Allergy	ALLERG	
persistent cough	Cystic Fibrosis	RESP	
	Human Metapneumovirus	N S INFEC	
+ add a clinical feature	Relapsing Polychondritis	RHEUM	
net checklist	Bronchiectasis	A A (?) RESP	
gereneenst	🖬 Brain Neoplasms 🔻	A A (?) NEURO	
clear search	Rhinitis Medicamentosa	A A (?) RESP	
Isabel is not meant to replace your clinical	Emphysema	A A RESP	
judgment.	Empirysenia	No Real	2

If this page is not displaying / functioning correctly, please click here

Legend: FIGURE 1. Isabel checklist.

Next to the name of each diagnosis there are thumbs up and thumbs down icons, allowing users to provide feedback to Isabel. Next to these feedback mechanisms is a question mark icon. When clicked, a "Why did this diagnosis come up?" box appears, explaining the logic behind each diagnosis. This box outlines which terms in the Isabel database were matched to the entered search terms as well as the degree of match. Beside the question mark icon is a prefix designating which specialty this particular diagnosis is associated with.

It is also interesting to note that once a list of possible diagnoses appears, additional search options are displayed on the left-hand side of the screen. Under the patient specifications, the "Refine search" options allow a user to input travel history [Western Europe, Eastern Europe, Central Africa, North Africa, East Africa, Southern Africa, West Africa, Southeast Asia, East Asia, South Asia, Caribbean, North America, Central America, South America (trop), South America (temp), Australasia, and Middle East]. In addition, users can select "causative drugs" and "bioterrorist agents" under the "Show me" section instead of the default "diagnoses." Clicking on "causative drugs" immediately changes the checklist to a list of medications displayed similarly to the diagnoses, with the thumbs up and thumbs down feedback mechanism and a question mark icon, which will display an answer to "Why did this drug come up?" Clicking on "bioterrorist agents" will do much the same, with a list of possible agents displayed.

KNOWLEDGE WINDOW

Clicking on a particular diagnosis on the checklist will open up a Knowledge Window particular for that diagnosis. For example, the author clicked on "Asbestosis," opening a window displaying a wealth of information on that topic (see Figure 2). The window includes a left-hand column with quick links to relevant information from a host of sources. The default information source is *The 5 Minute Clinical Consult*, the full text of which is displayed in the largest part of the window, including a description of the disease, signs and symptoms, causes, risk factors, differential diagnoses, and drugs of choice. It is important to note that all of this information is available through an Isabel subscription and a separate subscription to the resource is not required to view the information (e.g., although the University of Miami does not currently subscribe to *Griffith's 5 Minute Clinical Consult* separately, UM affiliates are able to access it using Isabel as seen in Figure 2).

Click on diagnoses to browse related	©Griffith's 5 Minute Clinical Consult 2004 Edition, Lippincott, William and Wilkins. All rights reserved.
Content	Close *
Euroal Phinosinusitis	
Bacterial Phinosinusitis	Sinusitis
Dacterial Killiosillusilis	A. Peter Catinella MD PULMONARY
Related content:	
Griffith's 5 Minute Clinical Consult	BASICS
Oxford Textbook of Medicine	DESCRIPTION
Journal Abstracts	Acute sinusitis is a symptomatic inflammation of the paranasal sinuses of less than 4 weeks duration occurring as a result of
What's New	impaired drainage and retained secretions. Subacute when symptomatic from 4-12 weeks. Chronic when symptomatic for greater than 12 weeks. Acute exacerbation of chronic disease when worsening of already symptomatic patient.
Lessons Learned	System(s) affected
Images	Pulmonary
and ges	Genetics
Google Images	No known genetic pattern
Web Resources	Incidence/Prevalence in USA
Louis Calder Memorial Library	To b of population annual diagnosis of sinusitis
UnToDate	Approximately 55% of office visits for young adults
	Incidence of both acute and chronic sinusitis increases in the latter part of childhood
Dynamed	Incidence increases up to age 75 and then decreases
Md Consult	Predominant age
CDC	All ages
PubMed	Predominant sex
Medline Dive	Both sexes equally
Medilie Flus	Sums & STMPTOMS
eMedicine (free reg. required)	Persistent duration of symptoms for at least one week
Google	Purilent nasal discharce
Wikipedia	Maxillary tooth or facial pain (especially if unilateral)
Medicine Health	Unilateral maxillary sinus tenderness
emedicine freatur	Worsening of symptoms after initial improvement
Guidelines	Other associated symptoms:
Institutions can link their own	Headache Data stittel pain
guidelines, protocols, algorithms &	
orders sets here.	Hynosomia
	Halitosis
	Chronic cough
	Symptoms indicating urgency:
	Orbital pain
	Visual disturbances, especially diplopia
	Periorbital swelling or erythema
	Hactal swelling or erythema
	mentation change

Legend: FIGURE 2. Asbestosis Knowledge Window

If relevant, related diagnoses are linked to in the upper left-hand corner. Below this top section is a long list of links to related information, both clinical and patient-oriented. For "Asbestosis," the top related content is from *The 5 Minute Clinical Consult* and the *Oxford Textbook of Medicine*. Clicking on one of these links will open the resource within the same window.

Beneath that resource are links to "What's New" and "Lessons Learned" taken from journal abstracts in PubMed. Clicking on these links will directly link to citations within the PubMed database by performing a predetermined search. In the case of "What's New," the search is limited to the last two years; the search is limited to case reports with "Lessons Learned." For example, the predetermined "What's New" search for Asbestosis (when conducted January 31, 2011) was as follows:

> asbestosis[Title/Abstract] AND (hasabstract[text] AND "humans"[MeSH Terms] AND English[lang] AND jsubsetaim[text] AND "2009/01/31"[PDAT] : "2011/01/31"[PDAT])

Following this section is a link to Google Images and then a long list of other "Web Resources." The first on this list is the subscriber's home page (in this case, the University of Miami's Louis Calder Memorial Library). This is followed by a link to UpToDate. If a user's institution does not have a subscription to UpToDate, the user will be in "Preview" mode, with only partial amounts of the available information accessible. Patient information from UpToDate is accessible in the preview mode, but much (if not all) of the clinical-oriented information is not.

The third and fourth resources on the checklist are DynaMed and MD Consult, respectively. Just as with the other databases, by clicking on these links, the window displays a search within the database of that topic. DynaMed displays a long list of search results (as is the norm in a DynaMed search), and MD Consult displays a list of recommended resources targeted to the most current and clinically useful content. If there is an MD Consult topic page for the diagnosis, the content is organized by overview, signs and symptoms, etiology, diagnosis, treatment and management, patient education, practice guidelines, and drugs. Each of these sections has a handful of resources culled from the MD Consult database most relevant to this topic. If no topic page exists, as is the case with asbestosis, the Knowledge Window displays a search in MD Consult, organized by books, journals, clinics, patient education, drugs, guidelines, images, and news. As with UpToDate, if an institution or a user does not pay for a subscription to these databases, users will only have access to that which is made broadly available (e.g., patient-oriented content).

Beneath these commercial databases are links to government resources including the Center for Disease Control (CDC), PubMed, and MedlinePlus. Clicking on the CDC link will automatically perform a search of the topic in the CDC's website. The PubMed link leads to a simple search of "Asbestosis" in PubMed, and the MedlinePlus link opens a new window with the search results from that robust consumer health database.

The remaining tools in the Web Resources section are links to additional free information sources, including eMedicine (which requires free registration), Google, Wikipedia, and eMedicine Health. The Google automated search was *Asbestosis more:for_health_professionals*, which displayed links to Wikipedia, Mayo Clinic, MedlinePlus, etc. Wikipedia displayed the relevant topic page, and clicking on eMedicine Health performed a search of "asbestosis" within that database.

The last section on the left-hand column of the Knowledge Window is labeled "Guidelines." This is a section where the institution can select to link to their own guidelines, protocols, algorithms, and orders. This section might be most helpful if Isabel were to be directly linked within an electronic health record.

MOBILE ACCESS

Isabel is formatted for hand-held, mobile devices,⁶ including Androids, iPads, iPhones and the iPod touch, along with any laptop, workstation, or tablet device. The mobile version of Isabel is very similar to the desktop version. The first screen in the mobile version simply shows the "enter clinical features" box. It asks the same questions (age, gender, and pregnancy) and asks for clinical features. The mobile version even features the autosuggest tool. After clicking "get checklist" a list of the top 10 diagnoses appears in a "diagnoses" window and the "enter clinical features" box moves to the bottom of the screen. It remains on the screen to allow for refinement of the search (e.g., travel history and "show me" causative drugs or bioterrorist agents instead of the default diagnoses).

In the mobile version, the knowledge window is considerably simplified. In the sample search of "asbestosis," the window displayed links to *The 5 Minute Clinical Consult* (which was the default resource displayed), Google, and Google images. This is a limitation of the mobile version, as not all of the information available in the desktop version is displayed in the mobile version. Consumer health information is nonexistent in the mobile version as well as links to databases such as UpToDate, DynaMed, and MD Consult.

ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

Isabel is recognized for AMA PRA Category 1 as a point-of-care learning system. By signing into the system, Isabel can capture an individual user's session including such details as queries and knowledge components used. Users must simply click "START CME Capture" on the top bar. Once a session has ended, the user must click "END CME Capture." After the capture has ended, a questionnaire is displayed, inviting users to enter information about how the information will be used. Questions include:

- What was your primary reason for accessing Isabel on this occasion?
- How did the information from Isabel influence your diagnostic assessment?
- Did using the Isabel system help you consider important diagnoses you hadn't thought of?
- How did using the Isabel system impact your management plans?
- To what extent did use of the Isabel system affect the quality of care the patient received or will receive?
- Other comments: (*with a field for users to enter their feedback*)

After filling out the questionnaire, a User session summary is displayed, with a breakdown of all the checklist searches, results, and components clicked on. Below this summary is a list of the answers to the above questions. This information must be printed, saved, or e-mailed at the time of the capture, as it is not saved in an individual's account. This is a convenient way to earn CME credits, as it requires minimal extra effort. Capturing a user's session allows Isabel to evaluate their product as well as a clinician to track the kind of information he or she seeks using the tool.

The remaining links at the top of the Isabel home page include:

• Administration Menu – reserved for institutional client partner administrators

- **IDEAS** includes known cases, where the user reviews the case, determines the key clinical features and potential diagnosis with the use of Isabel and then compares the user's determination to the known values (requires additional fee)
- **Support** opens an email to the Isabel support desk
- **Training Tools** features pamphlets and videos on how to search Isabel
- Mobile Access links users to the mobile version of the database

EVALUATING CLINICAL DECISION SUPPORT SYSTEMS

A comparative evaluation of four clinical decision support systems was conducted and published in 1994.⁷ This study found that although the systems never included all possible diagnoses, they did provide a mean of two additional possible diagnoses in addition to those diagnoses most obvious to the clinicians studied.

In 1998, a systematic review on the effects of clinical support systems on physician decisions and patient outcomes was published.⁸ This highly cited article concluded that, at the time, systems used to support diagnosis had not amalgamated enough compelling evidence to prove that they improved diagnostic performance.

The question of what metrics to use to compare or evaluate decision support systems is a difficult one. In 2003, Berner suggested that producing the correct diagnosis is only part of the criteria for success. Berner wrote that an ideal system would also include high quality assistance with the differential, appropriate management suggestions, user satisfaction, aspects of usability, and more.⁹

In Graber's study of medical students,¹⁰ he discusses the tendency for clinicians to "solve problems by "satisficing," accepting the first diagnosis that seems to adequately explain all the facts at hand, without a conscious consideration of other possibilities." Those seeking to add a CDSS might consider Graber's conclusion that CDSSs "have the potential to ameliorate these cognitive tendencies by assisting the clinician to consider a broader range of different diagnostic possibilities." Though certainly no substitute for clinical judgment, Isabel may improve diagnostic accuracy, particularly in complex cases that are difficult to diagnose.

FOR MORE INFORMATION

For more information on Isabel, please direct queries to:

Don Bauman 1710 Hermitage Ann Arbor, MI 48104 Tel : +1 734 332 0612 Cell : +1 734 276 1322

E-mail : Don.Bauman@isabelhealthcare.com

Queries may also be sent via the "contact" link on the Isabel home page or directly at http://www.isabelhealthcare.com/home/contactnew>.

REFERENCES

Nash, F.A. "Differential Diagnosis, an Apparatus to Assist the Logical Faculties." *Lancet* 266(April 24, 1954): 874-875.

2. Shortliffe, E.H., and Buchanan, B.G. "A Model of Inexact Reasoning in Medicine." *Mathematical Biosciences* 23, no 3-4 (1975): 351-379.

3. Barnett, G.O.; Cimino, J.J.; Hupp, J.A.; and Hoffer, E.P. "DXplain. An Evolving Diagnostic Decision-Support System." *Journal of the American Medical Association* 258, no. 1 (July 3, 1987): 67-74.

 Massachusetts General Hospital Laboratory of Computer Science – Projects – DXplain, Laboratory of Computer Science, Massachusetts General Hospital. Available:

http://lcs.mgh.harvard.edu/projects/dxplain.html. Accessed: January 18, 2011.

5. Isabel healthcare. Available: http://www.isabelhealthcare.com/. Accessed: January 6, 2011.

6. Isabel healthcare. "Mobile HELP!" Available:

http://www.isabelhealthcare.com/home/mobile_doc. Accessed: January 6, 2011.

7. Berner, E.S.; Webster, G.D.; Shugerman, A.A. et al. "Performance of Four Computer-Based Diagnostic Systems." *New England Journal of Medicine* 330, no. 25 (June 23, 1994): 1792-1796.

8. Hunt, D.L.; Haynes, R.B.; Hanna, S.E.; and Smith, K. "Effects of Computer-based Clinical Decision Support Systems on Physician Performance and Patient Outcomes." *JAMA; Journal of the American Medical Association* 280, no. 15 (October 21, 1998): 1339-1346.

 Berner, E.S. "Diagnostic Decision Support Systems: How to Determine the Gold Standard?" *Journal of the American Medical Informatics Association* 10, no. 6 (November-December 2003): 608-610.

10. Graber, M.; Tompkins, D.; and Holland, J. "Resources Medical Students Use to Derive a Differential Diagnosis." *Med Teach*. 31 (June 1, 2009):522–527.